

FINANCE COMMITTEE

MEETING MINUTES

May 22, 2019, 7:30 a.m.

304 E. Grand River, Board Chambers, Howell MI 48843

Members Present:

Carol Griffith, Douglas Helzerman, Kate Lawrence , William Green , Donald Parker, Robert Bezotte, Dennis Dolan , Gary Childs, and Wes Nakagiri

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Comm. Carol Griffith at

2. ROLL CALL

Indicated the presence of a quorum.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. Closed Session Minutes Dated: April 17, 2019

b. Meeting Minutes Dated: May 8, 2019

Motion to approve the minutes as presented.

Moved by: K. Lawrence

Seconded by: R. Bezotte

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

Motion to approve the minutes as presented.

Moved by: D. Helzerman

Seconded by: G. Childs

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

4. TABLED ITEMS FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

None.

5. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion to approve the Agenda as presented.

Moved by: D. Dolan

Seconded by: G. Childs

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None.

7. REPORTS

The Certificate of Recognition for the Honorable David Reader will be presented as the first item under Annual Reports, Agenda Item #9.1.

7.1 Commissioner Reports

Commissioner Nakagiri distributed "Analysis of Resolution 7.1 by Wes Nakagiri, Commissioner, District 3," (Attachment "A").

Commissioner Parker reported that he, along with Cindy Catanach and Therese Cremonte, attended the Homeland Security Conference in Grand Rapids.

Jeff Boyd reported that Therese Cremonte has been recognized as the Emergency Manager of the Year for the State of Michigan and was presented with this award at the Homeland Security Conference.

8. RESOLUTIONS FOR CONSIDERATION

8.1 Court Central Services

Resolution Authorizing a Contract Award to Paige M. Favio DBA: Paige M. Favio, P.C. to Provide Attorney Services for the Intensive Treatment Mental Health Court

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Sara Applegate presented the Resolution and answered questions.

Moved by: K. Lawrence

Seconded by: W. Green

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

8.2 Treasurer

Resolution Authorizing and Concurring with an Amendment to Resolution #2018-06-105 which Amended the Repayment Terms of the Short Term Loan From the Delinquent Tax Revolving Funds to the Livingston No. 1 Drainage District

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Moved by: D. Helzerman

Seconded by: G. Childs

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

8.3 Central Dispatch

Resolution Authorizing Livingston County 911 Central Dispatch to Contract Comcast Cable Communications Management, LLC to be Livingston County's Primary 911 Non-Emergency Line Service Provider

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Moved by: K. Lawrence

Seconded by: D. Dolan

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

8.4 Emergency Management

Resolution to Approve the FY 2018-2019 Hazardous Materials Emergency Preparedness Grant Program Award Agreement

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Moved by: R. Bezotte

Seconded by: K. Lawrence

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

8.5 Human Resources

Resolution Authorizing an Agreement with Energage, LLC to Provide Employee Engagement Surveying and Results Analysis and Briefing Services

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Jennifer Palmbos presented the resolution and answered questions.

Moved by: W. Green

Seconded by: D. Helzerman

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

9. ANNUAL REPORTS

9.1 Certificate of Recognition

The Honorable David Reader

Commissioner Parker presented the Certificate of Recognition to the Honorable David Reader.

9.2 Emergency Medical Services

Jeff Boyd, Director of EMS, presented the EMS Annual Report.

9.3 Emergency Management

Therese Cremona, Emergency Manager, presented the Emergency Management Annual Report.

10. CLAIMS

Miscellaneous Claims Dated: May 22, 2019

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Moved by: K. Lawrence

Seconded by: G. Childs

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

11. PREAUTHORIZED

Computer Print-out Dated: May 9 through May 22, 2019

Recommend Motion to the Board of Commissioners.

Moved by: K. Lawrence

Seconded by: G. Childs

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

12. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Elizabeth Hundley, County Clerk, thanked the Veterans Services Committee for agreeing to the cover cost for Veterans ID cards for residents.

13. ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn the meeting at 9:26 a.m.

Moved by: K. Lawrence

Seconded by: R. Bezotte

Yes (9): C. Griffith, K. Lawrence , W. Green , D. Helzerman, D. Parker, R. Bezotte, D. Dolan , G. Childs, and W. Nakagiri

Motion Carried (9-0-0)

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Natalie Hunt", is written over a horizontal line.

Natalie Hunt, Recording Secretary

Analysis of Resolution 7.1 by Wes Nakagiri, Commissioner, District 3

Below are my comments regarding a resolution which was presented to the Personnel Committee on 5/15/19. I will elaborate further at the Finance Committee Meeting and the Board of Commissioners Meeting.

Clarifying Cost Neutrality

I attended the May 15, 2019 meeting of the Personnel Committee to listen to the discussion and debate surrounding Resolution 7.1: Resolution Authorizing Reclassification of a Secretary/Circuit Court Position.

During the discussion Court Administration asserted that Resolution 7.1 was brought forward due to a reorganization of job duties following the recent judicial change where Livingston County Courts decreased by one District Court Judge and simultaneously increased by one Circuit Court Judge. Court Administration suggested that by approving the recent judicial change, the Board of Commissioners (BOC) was substantially responsible for the need to implement Resolution 7.1. Court Administration continued that the job change and resultant costs associated with Resolution 7.1 resulted from the BOC's decision.

During the second call to the public I disagreed with the assertion that the BOC was responsible for costs associated with Resolution 7.1 as the BOC detrimentally relied upon the Court's prior statement that the judicial change would be "cost neutral." The written record shows that just prior to voting to approve the judicial change, the BOC received a letter from then Chief Judge Reader stating the judicial change would be "cost neutral."¹

The record clearly shows the Court previously told the BOC that the judicial change would be cost neutral. As a matter of policy it is always best to avoid the use of unsubstantiated assertions when seeking resolution approval.

Analysis of the Resolution

When Livingston County added one Circuit Court Judge and eliminated one District Court Judge there was no net change in the total number of Judges in our county. Intuitively this suggests that support staff and their duties should not substantially change with this new judicial arrangement. Supporting this viewpoint is the letter from Judge Reader stating that this judicial change would be "cost neutral."

While this judicial change was supposed to be cost neutral, we have seen otherwise. How? Recently the Livingston County Clerk's office incurred additional cost when it had to add headcount and the associated employee benefits in order to accommodate a new courtroom schedule chosen by Court leaders. After investigating, I've concluded that other courtroom schedules were available to the Court which would have negated the need to incur this added cost.

Now with Resolution 7.1, the Court is choosing to reorganize job responsibilities of their staff in a manner that gives inadequate consideration to the cost side of the ledger. By taking job duties away from others and adding these duties to the Secretary/Circuit Court, the Court created a situation where it now is requesting additional compensation for the Secretary/Circuit Court.

While it is fair to discuss and debate the merits of a higher pay grade in light of additional duties, it is not fair to ask the taxpayers to pay more. I draw this conclusion because the current allocation of job duties is structured in a more cost effective manner than what is being proposed.² The Court can continue to provide citizens with more than a serviceable level of performance without incurring the extra cost of this resolution. Taxpayers should not have to foot the bill when the Court willingly chooses to operate in a less efficient manner.

¹ In his August 11, 2017 letter to the BOC, Livingston County Chief Judge David Reader stated the judicial change would be "cost neutral." A copy of this letter can be found on page eight of the [board packet](#) for the 9/5/17 BOC meeting.

² With respect to the duties added to the Secretary/Circuit Court, it is reasonable to ask who used to perform these duties. Further, it is reasonable to consider a change in job grade for others now that they have fewer job duties.