



**Bid Recap
For
Architectural Consulting Services**

Lead Public Agency: Livingston County
Solicitation: RFP-LC-20-30

RFP Issued & Publicly Posted: 12/14/20
Public Posting: Livingston County Fiscal
Services Website and BidNet

RFP Proposals Due Date: 01/11/21

Proposals Received: 16

Livingston County received sixteen proposals in response to the Request for Proposal (RFP) referenced above. Below is a recap of the bid evaluation.

The following architectural firms provided a response within the timeframe outlined in the RFP:

A3C – Collaborative Architecture
DLZ
Fishbeck
Hobbs + Black Architects
Hooker DeJong Inc.
Hubbell Roth and Clark
JFR Architects
John Stewart Associates

Lindhout Associates
Mitchell & Mouat Architects
Niagara Murano
NORR
NSA Architecture
Partners in Architecture
Straub Pettitt Yaste Architects
Tower Pinkster Titus Associates Inc.

The evaluation consisted of a review of the responses to the Request for Proposal Scope of Work. A review of the minimum requirements revealed that the firms met the minimum mandatory requirements (Section 1.1), and confirmed their understanding of the Scope of Work (Sections 1.2 through 1.4). The firms were determined to be responsive and responsible after a review of the answers to the Scope of Work sections and the information provided on the requisite forms.

The Evaluation Review Committee (ERC) consisted of six members. The ERC evaluated the proposals submitted by each vendor using the following scoring criteria:

- Proposal Responses (up to 50 points)
- Company Profile (up to 25 points)
- References (up to 25 points)

Based on this scoring criteria, the points awarded to each firm were averaged and the firms were ranked in order from 1 to 15. Two out of the sixteen firms had a tie score and were ranked fourth respectively. The results were as follows:



	Firms							
	Lindhout	Fishbeck	DLZ	NORR	NSA	Hobbs + Black	Partners	A3C
Proposal Responses	40.83	42.5	42.67	39.5	39.17	39.83	38.83	40.0
Company Profile	20.33	20.5	18.67	18.67	18.17	17.0	16.67	15.17
References	20.5	18.33	19.83	19.17	20.0	18.67	19.67	19.83
Total	81.66	81.33	81.17	77.34	77.34	75.5	75.17	75.0

	Firms							
	Mitchell & Mouat	Hubbell Clark & Roth	Tower Pinkster Titus	JFR Architects	Niagara Murano	Hooker DeJong	Straub Pettitt Yaste	John Stewart
Proposal Responses	40.17	38.33	39.50	32.5	33.0	29.83	29.83	27.0
Company Profile	16.33	16.33	14.83	12.33	8.83	11.0	9.0	10.83
References	18.17	20.0	19.83	18.67	16.50	16.0	14.50	15.33
Total	74.67	74.66	74.16	63.5	58.33	56.83	53.33	53.16

One-hour interviews were conducted with the top five scoring firms on Monday, February 22, 2021. Because two of the firms were ranked fourth in the overall scoring, DLZ, Fishbeck, Lindhout Associates, NORR, and NSA Architecture were selected for interview. The ERC then met on Wednesday, February 24, 2021 to discuss the information obtained from the interviews as well as the technical and pricing proposals.

The ERC recommended that additional questions be asked of the following two firms in order to make a final recommendation for award: Lindhout Associates and DLZ. Additional questions were sent to both firms on Thursday, February 25, 2021. Answers to the questions were submitted by the firms on Monday, March 1, 2021.

Based on the entire evaluation process, Lindhout Associates provided the proposal that offered the greatest overall value to the county. It is recommended that a five-year contract be awarded to Lindhout Associates. Lindhout Associates will also be awarded a CoPro+ cooperative contract not to exceed five years.