





## Bid Recap For Commercial Appraisal Services

Lead Public Agency: Livingston County Solicitation: RFP-LC-24-15

**RFP Proposals Due Date:** 8/5/2024

RFP Issued & Publicly Posted: 7/8/2024 Public Posting: Livingston County Fiscal Services Website and BidNet Proposals Received: 3

Section 211.34 of the General Property Act requires the Equalization department to study each class of property every year. To do this the Equalization department provides appraisals samples of each class of property to each unit of government and to the State Tax Commission. With the limited availability of qualified people in the field, Livingston County has determined a need to contract for commercial appraisal services.

A Request for Proposal (RFP) was publicly posted on two websites resulting in the bid documents being downloaded by fourteen (14) qualified companies. The notice was also sent to one known vendor.

Livingston County received three (3) proposals in response to the Request for Proposal (RFP) referenced above. Below is a list of the responses received and a recap of the bid evaluation.

BBG Real Estate Services Legacy Assessing Tyler Technologies

All responses were received within the timeframe outlined in the RFP.

The Evaluation Review Committee (ERC) consisted of three members. The ERC evaluated the proposal using the following scoring criteria:

- Proposal Responses (up to 40 points)
- Company Profile (up to 10 points)
- References (up to 20 points)
- Pricing Proposal (up to 30 points)

The evaluation consisted of a review of the responses to the Request for Proposal Scope of Work. A review of the minimum requirements revealed that the vendors met the minimum mandatory requirements and confirmed their understanding of the Scope of Work (Section 1), however, after discussion there were some concerns.







BBG Real Estate had a very professional presentation. However, they are an out of state vendor and did not seem to be familiar with the Michigan state laws regarding the required State Tax Commission (STC) class and, therefore, would not qualify unless taken. They also submitted the highest cost.

Tyler Technologies also had a great presentation and had a more competitive price; however, the reference checks did indicate that spot checks were needed for completion of work. Two of the three people listed were not certified with the state. Legacy Assessment's presentation was vague and lacked specifics, however, the staff is all certified, they provided great refences, and the lowest price. They are the incumbent and have done a great job for Livingston County.

Based on the entire evaluation process, Legacy Assessment provided a proposal that offered the best overall value to the county. It is recommended that a five-year contract be awarded to Legacy Assessment.